



**SYNOPSIS OF THE FEBRUARY 24, 2022 MEETING OF THE
NEW YORK METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COUNCIL**

A. CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL

The meeting was called to order by **Ron Epstein, Secretary** to the New York Metropolitan Transportation Council (NYMTC) and Executive Deputy Commissioner of the New York State Department of Transportation (NYSDOT). He explained that the New York State Department of Transportation Commissioner Marie Therese Dominquez was called away by Governor Hochul to address winter storm emergency preparations. Therefore, he would serve as both Secretary and acting Co-Chair for the meeting. He completed a roll call of the Council members declared a quorum under the New York Metropolitan Transportation Council (NYMTC) Operating Procedures.

B. CO-CHAIRS' REMARKS

Executive Deputy Commissioner Epstein welcomed the newest members of the Council—the New York City Department of Transportation Commissioner Ydanis Rodriguez, the New York City Department of City Planning Director Dan Garodnick, Nassau County Executive Bruce Blakeman and the United State Environmental Protection Agency Regional Administrative Lisa Garcia. He said the work that is done through the Council is extraordinarily important to meeting the needs of travelers of all ages and abilities and enhancing mobility for those who rely on the multitude of services that are provided by the Council's members. He thanked the members and staff of NYMTC for their work keeping the region resilient during recent dark and difficult times. Mr. Epstein pointed out that the pandemic has highlighted the gaps in opportunity in the region, as well as access to the transportation system—how they are served, where they are served and the affordability of the services. He said moving forward, he believes that a renewed and reinvigorated effort to address the needs of everyone as the we build back the economy in the region and its infrastructure with the assistance of the federal government. Mr. Epstein noted that the landmark federal Infrastructure Investment and Jobs Act legislation provides stability and challenges states with addressing the transportation needs of low and moderate income communities. The legislation helps States to facilitate carbon reduction strategies and resiliency and for the first time it includes a housing coordination process to address the integration of housing, transportation and economic development strategies. He said that system basis, not project bases, needed to be viewed to ensure that real needs were being addressed.

Suffolk County Executive Steve Bellone welcomed everyone and thanked the members for their continued leadership. County Executive Bellone said that as we move past the COVID-19 pandemic, continued efforts must be focused on modernizing our transit system and incorporating everything we've learned over the past two years. He noted that transit systems were still trying to rebound and needed to be equitably expanded for all county residents. He reported that Suffolk County is working on different initiatives to build out a 21st century transportation network, such as preparing a feasibility plan to convert all county operated vehicles to electric by 2030, procuring and installing charging equipment, and updating infrastructure and leasing electric vehicles. He talked about the county's Reimagine Transit initiative--to rethink the entire network of Suffolk County bus transit routes to ensure the county makes the best use of its resources and aligns its investments with

**MEETING SYNOPSIS OF THE FEBRUARY 24, 2022
NEW YORK METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COUNCIL**

community goals and priorities. A draft network redesign plan will be released for public review and comment and is expected to be finalized by mid-2022. County Executive Bellone announced that the Route 110 Bus Rapid Transit project was in its final stages and would be the first BRT system on Long Island. He thanked New York State Transportation Commissioner Dominguez and Governor Hochul for their support in developing this project. He urged that high speed rail initiatives be included in discussions on transportation and equity, describing the North Atlantic high speed rail concept as the first of its kind, powered from renewable energy sources that would contribute zero carbon mobility system. He said thinking big was the only way to grow the economy and maximize the limited resources available. He said that it was an exciting moment in history for Suffolk County and was optimistic for what the future would bring.

C. KEYNOTE SPEAKER –

Eddie Bautista, Executive Director, New York City Environmental Justice Alliance

Mr. Eddie Bautista, Executive Director of the New York City Environmental Justice Alliance, provided keynote remarks. Mr. Bautista began by acknowledging that mobility and transportation have been central historically to Black liberation and the fight for dignity in the country, from the underground railroad to Plessy vs. Ferguson to the Great Migration to the Montgomery bus boycott. Mr. Bautista then discussed the disproportionate impacts of transportation-related pollution to communities of color. He cited that 75% of bus depots in New York City, which contribute to greenhouse gas emissions, are located in communities of color. He noted that the South Bronx is surrounded by the Cross Bronx Expressway, the Bruckner Expressway and the Deegan Expressway, which results in disproportionate impacts on communities and exposures to fine particulate matter emissions. He pointed out the disproportionate impacts of COVID-19 on communities of color in terms of higher rates of illness and fatalities. Mr. Bautista noted that making smart decisions when expanding mobility and transportation opportunities while looking to reduce the disproportionate impacts in the communities of color was necessary going forward. He stressed the need for more investment in transit infrastructure to address these environmental disparities by taking advantage of the flexibility available to the NYMTC agencies in the new federal legislation.

After the presentation, the NYMTC members engaged Mr. Bautista in a discussion of a number of points, including the need to ensure that equity is considered in project decision-making, and the challenge of building consensus throughout the region on a framework of equity.

Mr. Epstein said that he was pleased that the legislation includes investment in public transportation and opens up opportunities for micro mobility that had not previously existed.

Commissioner Ydanis Rodriguez noted that he and Mayor Eric Adams were not only focused on micro mobility, but also transportation sustainability, accessibility, safety and repurposing. He noted that equity was a challenge and there were challenges in the South Bronx and other working class communities in the five boroughs because of the lack of investment in these communities for decades. He suggested thinking outside the box and understanding the challenges in the working class communities and their connection to all transportation modes.

Metropolitan Transportation Authority Senior Vice President for Regional Planning Michael Shiffer noted that equity is a key element of MTA's services and central to the MTA's planning activities. He said that the bus network redesign in New York City is significant and will be reviewed borough by borough with the expectations to connect better with communities and provide more reliable,

**MEETING SYNOPSIS OF THE FEBRUARY 24, 2022
NEW YORK METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COUNCIL**

faster services. He said the electrification of buses was one of the cornerstones to reducing emissions.

Westchester County Director of Transportation Planning Naomi Klein offered Westchester County Executive George Latimer's apologies for not being in attendance. Ms. Klein added that Westchester County was undertaking a bus redesign study. She noted that the majority of bus riders were minorities and people with low income, and it was essential to take into account equity, mobility and transportation issues and improve transit services.

Federal Highway Administration Division Administrator Richard Marquis confirmed that the United States Department of Transportation's and the Federal Highway Administration's priorities on equity and climate change will be seen as programs are rolled out to states and other stakeholders. He noted that the Infrastructure Program, the Bridge and Structures Program and the Highway Safety Improvement Program all encourage states to consider equity in prioritizing projects.

D. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

Mary Arnold, representing Civics United for Railroad Environmental Solutions (CURES), submitted remarks urging the Council to fund a regional study of needs and opportunities associated with the movement of solid waste in the NYMTC region. See Attachment 1.

Murray Bodin, Concerned Grandparents, commented on increasing bus speeds in New York City and pointed out that the Manual on Uniform Traffic Control Devices needs to be updated with regard to road markings. He said the world is changing and the way business was done 50 years ago isn't applicable today.

Timothy Karcich expressed his disappointment that funding for Suffolk County's transit bus routes and paratransit services has been proposed to be cut. He encouraged County Executive Bellone to support environmental legislation such as the Build Public Renewables Act and the Long Island Power Authority Commission Bill. He believed that the Build Public Renewables Act was the bill that could help meet the Climate Leadership and Community Protection Act energy standards and that public power is New York's best chance for a future free from fossil fuels that would benefit future generations.

Kerim Odekon of the Brookhaven Landfill Action & Remediation Group submitted remarks requesting leadership and public equitable transparent regional and sustainable zero waste planning. See Attachment 2.

E. ACTION ITEMS

1. ACCEPT: SEPTEMBER 9, 2021 MEETING SYNOPSIS

Executive Deputy Commissioner Epstein referenced the September 9, 2021 meeting synopsis and asked if any of the members had any comments. There were none. Acceptance of the meeting synopsis was moved by Stephen Powers representing Rockland County Executive Ed Day and seconded by Michael Shiffer representing the Metropolitan Transportation Authority Chair and Chief Executive Officer Janno Lieber. The meeting synopsis was unanimously accepted by the members of the New York Metropolitan Transportation Council.

**MEETING SYNOPSIS OF THE FEBRUARY 24, 2022
NEW YORK METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COUNCIL**

2. ADOPT: RESOLUTION #2022-1 – COUNCIL ADOPTION OF THE STATE FISCAL YEAR 2022-2023 UNIFIED PLANNING WORK PROGRAM

Michael Chiume of NYMTC staff provide an overview of the State Fiscal Year (SFY) 2022-2023 Unified Planning Work Program (UPWP). He described the UPWP as a federal required product which serves as NYMTC's annual budget and describes how NYMTC will use federal transportation planning funds in its planning area. He noted that the shared goals of NYMTC's Regional Transportation Plan, *Moving Forward*, guide the development and execution of the UPWP. He noted that the total budget for SFY 2022-23 is approximately \$56.5 million and that it will support NYMTC staff activities as well as the member agencies' activities.

A motion to adopt Resolution #2022-1, Adoption of the State Fiscal Year 2022-2023 Unified Planning Work Program was made by Naomi Klein representing Westchester County Executive George Latimer and seconded by Ron Epstein representing New York State Department of Transportation Commissioner Marie Therese Dominguez. There was no discussion. The resolution was passed unanimously.

3. ADOPT: RESOLUTION #2022-2 – RECOGNITION OF SERVICE BY LAURA CURRAN, FORMER NASSAU COUNTY EXECUTIVE, HENRY GUTMAN, FORMER NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION COMMISSIONER AND MARISA LAGO, FORMER NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF CITY PLANNING DIRECTOR AS PRINCIPAL MEMBERS OF THE NEW YORK METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COUNCIL

A motion to adopt Resolution #2022-2, Recognition of Service by Laura Curran, Former Nassau County Executive, Henry Gutman, Former New York City Department of Transportation Commissioner, and Marisa Lago, Former New York City Department of City Planning Director, as Principal Members of the New York Metropolitan Transportation Council was made by Stephen Powers representing Rockland County Executive Ed Day, and seconded by Jack Schmidt representing New York City Department of City Planning Director Dan Garodnick. There was no discussion. The resolution was passed unanimously.

**MEETING SYNOPSIS OF THE FEBRUARY 24, 2022
NEW YORK METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COUNCIL**

4. ADOPT: RESOLUTION #2022-3 – RECOGNITION OF SERVICE AS NYMTC CO-CHAIR BY SUFFOLK COUNTY EXECUTIVE STEVE BELLONE

Executive Deputy Commissioner Epstein noted that the resolution expressed the members' appreciation to County Executive Bellone for his service and guidance as the NYMTC Co-Chair during the 2021 program year. He said that County Executive Bellone served with distinction and provided valuable guidance to the Council as Co-Chair. He thanked County Executive Bellone and said that he looked forward to continuing working with him on the Council.

A motion to adopt Resolution #2022-3, Recognition of Service as NYMTC Co-Chair by Suffolk County Executive Steve Bellone was made by Naomi Klein representing Westchester County Executive George Latimer and seconded by Jack Schmidt representing New York City Department of City Planning Director Dan Garodnick. There was no discussion. The resolution was passed unanimously.

6. CONFIRM: NEW YORK CITY DEPARTMENT OF CITY PLANNING DIRECTOR DAN GARODNICK AS THE INCOMING CO-CHAIR FOR 2022-2023

Executive Deputy Commissioner Epstein noted that each year, the Co-Chair for the Council is rotated annually among the three NYMTC Transportation Coordinating Committees. He welcomed Dan Garodnick as the incoming NYMTC Co-Chair, representing the New York City Transportation Coordinating Committee for the 2022 program year and said that he looked forward to working with him.

F. INFORMATION ITEM

DEVELOPMENT OF NYMTC'S FFYs 2023-2027 TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM

NYMTC Assistant Director Gerry Bogacz updated the Council members on the development of NYMTC's Federal Fiscal Years 2023-2027 Transportation Improvement Program (TIP). The TIP is a multi-modal program of transportation improvements that establishes eligibility for federal funding for individual projects. He noted that the TIP is a federally mandated product that must be consistent with the new Regional Transportation Plan and must conform with mobile source emissions milestones laid out in New York State's Implementation Plan for Air Quality. Mr. Bogacz indicated that after public review and comment on proposed projects, the Council would reconvene on September 8, 2022 to adopt a new TIP.

G. CONFIRM NEXT COUNCIL MEETING

The next meeting of the Council was confirmed to be held on September 8, 2022.

H. The Council Meeting was adjourned.

**MEETING SYNOPSIS OF THE FEBRUARY 24, 2022
NEW YORK METROPOLITAN TRANSPORTATION COUNCIL**

ATTENDANCE

Voting Council Principals/Representatives

Steven Bellone, Suffolk County Executive (Co-Chair)
Ron Epstein for Marie Therese Dominguez, NYS Department of Transportation (Co-Chair)
Ron Epstein, NYMTC Secretary
Dan Garodnick, NYC Department of City Planning Executive Director
Naomi Klein for George Latimer, Westchester County Executive
MaryEllen Odell, Putnam County Executive
Stephen Powers for Ed Day, Rockland County Executive
Ydanis Rodriguez, NYC Department of Transportation Commissioner
Sean Sallie for Bruce Blakeman, Nassau County Executive
Michael Shiffer for Janno Lieber, Chair & CEO, Metropolitan Transportation Authority

Advisory (Non-Voting) Principals/Representatives

Mary D. Ameen, North Jersey Transportation Planning Authority Executive Director
Jack Dean for Kevin Corbett, New Jersey Transit President and CEO
Stephen Goodman, Federal Transit Administration Regional Administrator
Richard Marquis, Federal Highway Administration Division Administrator
Mary K. Murphy for Richard Cotton, Executive Director, Port Authority of New York & New Jersey
Lisa Garcia, US Environmental Protection Agency Regional Administrator
Michael Sheehan for Basil Seggos, New York State Dept. of Environmental Conservation Commissioner

NYMTC Staff & Consultants*

Olayinka Alamu *	Anthony Inzerillo
Seitu Allen	Carl King
Gerry Bogacz	David Lake
Stephanie Brooks *	John Lopez
Mary Byrne	Jack Ma *
Michael Chiume	Andrea Miles-Cole
Kimberly Estes	Ali Mohseni
Daniel Etkin	Debra Nelson
Maura Fitzpatrick *	Munnesh Patel
Leslie Fordjour	Abdus Salam
Merrill Frank	Manish Shah
Yevgeniy Galinski	John Simpson
Fidel Garcia *	Lynn Thisse
Chris Hardej	

OTHERS

Joseph Brown, Nassau County
Murray Bodin, Concerned Grandparents
Chris Chatterton, Suffolk County
Catherine Corless, MTA
Cynthia Danza, NYCDOT
Nicole Farmer, NYSDOT
Michael T. Flynn, NYSDOT
Oluseye Folarin, MTA
Ian Francis, NYSDOT
Patrick Gerdin, Rockland County
Tatyana Golikova, NYSDOT
Carolyn Grossman, NYCDCP

Sandra Jobson, NYSDOT
Uchenna Madu, NYSDOT
Gautam Mani, FHWA
Daniel Moser, FTA
Jose Rivera
Craig Ruyle, NYSDOT
Yogesh Sanghvi, NYCDOT
Jack Schmidt, NYCDCP
Julia Seltzer, MTA
Jay Shuffield, PANYNJ
David Viana, Nassau County

Respectfully Submitted,

Andréa Miles-Cole

**Andréa Miles-Cole
Administrative Specialist 1
NYMTC**

draft - unapproved document



Good morning. My name is Mary Arnold representing Civics United for Railroad Environmental Solutions. Thank you for this opportunity to urge the Council to fund the Action Item in your Regional Transportation Plan Update for a regional study of needs and opportunities associated with the movement of solid waste in the NYMTC Region. The study is a crucial part of fulfilling the Need for Cleaner freight Operations, as well as Environmental Justice, Quality of Life, and Environmental Goals.

This solid waste study will provide crucial information for the historic opportunities Governor Hochul mandated through her Interborough Express, Cross Harbor Freight marine, and Climate Change initiatives. NYMTC's study plays a critical role in crafting a modern freight and transit system that improves the region's environment, community health, and quality of life, and includes rail and marine freight at a time when NOAA predicts up to one foot of sea level rise in less than 30 years.

Over the past 25 years, freight rail facilities have been diverted to passenger transit and redeveloped for "higher yielding land uses." Today, the New York City area's main export by tonnage is waste and scrap, with a significant amount hauled by rail. Freight movement problems as well as community health and quality of life problems will increase if the Bay Ridge is also ceded to passenger transit without similarly transformative plans for freight facilities and movement. This is because the Interborough Express, Cross Harbor Freight marine enhancement, and the ongoing exponential increase in waste-by-rail export all hub around tiny 10-acre Fresh Pond Rail Yard.

Fresh Pond Yard is already a bottleneck, where all freight lines switch and freight coming on and off Long Island is handled. It's like there's a one-cup measure available, and every siloed agency and hauler wants to put the contents of their 5 gallon bucket into it. The area has twice the COVID case rate of Queens and more than twice NYC's rate. To speak to Mr. Shiffer's point about "lightly used" freight lines and the Interborough Express, the MTA's feasibility study has photos showing rail cars stored on two tracks, and one active track. Car storage and freight moves already spill over onto tracks in neighborhoods. Open rail cars of landfill-bound waste emit odors, blowoff, and leachate. 1970's freight locomotives spew toxic diesel exhaust, even though the LIRR has received \$25M to retool them to Tier 4 switchers. Piecemeal expansion plans for using freight rail have not come with commensurate mitigation of increased pollution, noise -- much less systemic modernization of freight system facilities and operations. To speak to Mr. Bautista's point, Environmental Justice communities inside and outside NYC are still being targeted disproportionately for waste processing -- now by rail -- while too little is being done to keep waste from being exported to landfills. Please make the solid waste Action Item a priority and fund it. Thank you.

My name is Kerim Odekon, I am a member of the Brookhaven Landfill Action & Remediation Group, a community-based environmental justice coalition in Suffolk County focused on closing and remediating the Brookhaven Landfill AND advocating for equitable, public regional zero waste planning in LI.

The Brookhaven landfill takes two million people's incinerator ash and construction and demolition debris. The landfill's fence line communities like North Bellport have the lowest life expectancy in all of Long Island, the second highest asthma ER visits in Suffolk County.

The Brookhaven Landfill is slated to close in 2024. Now a private waste hauler Winter Bros bought a railroad and is trying to build NYS's largest waste transfer station across the street from the landfill – in an overburdened NYSDEC EJ area - using the Federal Surface Transportation Board to bypass local zoning and silence the voice and power of local EJ communities.

I am speaking today because on the one hand the NYMTC embraces powerful visionary environmental and civil rights leaders like Eddie Bautista and Regional Administrator Garcia and champions an equitable freight transportation system. On the other hand, the NYMTC is honoring our County Executive and NYMTC Co Chair Steve Bellone. Unfortunately, politicians like Mr. Bellone not only fail to advance an environmental justice agenda, but their silence promotes environmental injustice. Just last month the NYSNAACP issued a press release – let me quote it here – “Bellone has demonstrated that when confronted by environmental racism, he won't stand up for our community but instead will hide behind sad excuses [...] Steve Bellone clearly has no problem turning former county owned property into a massive dump for New York City garbage and has shown zero concern that this would all take place in a potential Environmental Justice Area as determined by the state Department of Environmental Conservation said Dr. Grier-Key. "Silence is golden for Bellone, or at least green. But all the campaign cash in the world won't overcome the fact he has refused to stand with people of color when we needed his help."

Unfortunately, Bellone is not alone in his silence, lack of vision and action.

Last year Assemblyman Englebright – the only LI politician to make equitable zero waste management a public policy issue - earmarked hundreds of thousands of dollars for “regional municipal solid waste management and waste transportation planning, including for impacted environmental justice communities associated with impending landfill closures.” Yet when we spoke with Assemblyman Englebright's counsel, we were told that NYS DEC refused to take these funds directly, only agreeing to be a pass-through agency.

NYS DEC Commissioner Seggos is a member of the NYMTC advisory board. We have repeatedly reached out to NYS DEC to ask them to take a lead on regional waste management planning in Long Island, as the agency that regulates all local solid waste management plans and permits waste infrastructure, they have full power to shepherd Long Island's fragmented, inexperienced, and conflicted governments towards equitable and sustainable waste planning. Unfortunately, NYS DEC refuses to do so, even when communities successfully lobby for funding to assist their staff to do this work.

When leaders like Steve Bellone and Basil Seggos abdicate their responsibility to lead in this environmental crisis, they hand the keys to private waste haulers who repeatedly target communities for color and economically disadvantaged communities across NYS.

We need real leadership from all agencies including NYMTC, and we need public equitable transparent regional and sustainable zero waste planning. Long Island's EJ crisis is NYC and NYS's EJ crisis.

Kerim Odekon
Suffolk County, NY